SUMMARY MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA

Lower Level – Room 41, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard **September 9, 2010**

Present: Robert Ferguson, Jennifer Haskamp, Pat Igo, John Manning, Matt Mazanec, Lee

Meyer, Steve Trimble, Diane Trout-Oertel

Absent: Rich Laffin (excused), David Riehle (excused), Mark Thomas (excused)

Staff Present: Amy Spong, Christine Boulware,

BUSINESS MEETING

CALL TO ORDER: 5:07 PM by John Manning (Chair)

I. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA – Igo, Trout-Oertel (8-0)

II. CONFLICTS OF INTEREST - None

III. APPROVAL OF THE MEETING MINUTES - Trout-Oertel, Ferguson (8-0)

- A. June 24, 2010 Public Hearing approved
- **B.** August 12, 2010 Business Meeting approved
- C. August 26, 2010 Public Hearing Laid over to the October 7 meeting

IV. CHAIR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

A. Manning noted that the agenda is large and the HPC usually does not review public hearing items at a business meeting.

V. STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS

- A. August Design Review Statistics
- B. Staff received a letter from SHPO regarding the OMF as an adverse impact.

VI. PUBLIC HEARING/PERMIT REVIEW/AFTER-THE-FACT REVIEW

A. 280 Maple Street, Dayton's Bluff Historic District, by owner, for a building permit to replace windows. Work was completed without a permit or HPC review. File #10-040 Staff read the report recommending denial of the permit application and further recommending that the windows, door and trim that were installed without a permit be removed and replaced to match the original configuration, size, material and profile within sixty days and that the applicant work with HPC staff to create an application that would comply with the Dayton's Bluff Historic District Guidelines. Commissioner Trimble informed staff and the commission that he observed new shutters being installed at the property prior to him attending the public hearing. The applicant was not present to discuss the application or answer questions. LouAnn Nordquist, 507 Arcade, was present to speak in opposition to the application. She stated that she had been watching work at the property continue without a permit and that the boards had been slathered with patching compound. She added that the house does not show "pride of ownership." The public hearing was closed, as no one else was present to speak. Commissioner Meyer motioned to deny the application with staff recommendations. Commissioner Trout-Oertel seconded the motion. Commissioner Igo asked if a stop work order had been issued. Staff indicated that a work order was placed but the applicant continued to do work. Commissioner Trimble asked as a friendly amendment that removal of the shutters be added to the decision and amendment was accepted. Commissioner Meyer noted the owner will not be able to get a Certificate of Occupancy without finaling his permits. The motion passed 8-0.

B. 587 Summit Avenue, Hill Historic District, by Pella Windows, for a building permit to replace thirty-five windows in one unit of the building. File #10-041 Staff read the report recommending denial of the application. Tim Lawson from Pella windows was present to discuss the application and answer questions. Trout-Oertel noted the windows didn't appear to be in a condition that required replacement. Staff indicated there were a few windows with areas of rot. Lawson explained the goal was to keep the property historic and he recognized the historic integrity. He added that they didn't plan to replace the leaded transoms or brickmould. Lawson stated that the windows are out-of-square and don't open. He added that the owner wants energy efficiency and can't clean the windows. He continued that the windows would be built custom to the inside and the weight pockets will be insulated. Larson informed that the two-over-two configuration can be duplicated and that other units don't have them and the building would become more of a patchwork if required. He discussed half versus full screens stating that the existing windows have combinations with half-screens and installing full-screens would create more of a patchwork. Lawson stated the window need to be replaced for a lead-safe renovation since there are kids in the more and that repair of the windows would ruin the integrity. He stated they would install two-over-two double-hung windows with full-screens in order to get the HPC's approval. Lawson clarified that the installation of the Pella product would result in the loss of 1 1/4" of glass. Manning asked if the other property owners in the row house were in agreement with the window replacement. Lawson replied there are four other owners and the customer can't approach the neighbors, so there is not an agreement. Meyer asked for clarification about how far out of plumb the windows were. Lawson replied he should check out the condition and see that the windows need replacement. Staff explained that in other row houses with multiple ownership scenarios, the association works to create a plan for window replacement so the building doesn't end up with a patchwork of windows. Lawson explained that the building does not have an association. Staff suggested that the owner type a letter and ask the neighbors for their signatures as was requested in early contact between staff and the applicant. There was no one else present to speak and no testimony was received. The public hearing was closed.

Meyer motioned to deny the application. Igo seconded the motion. Igo stated it is difficult that there is not an association, but it is important and window replacement should be done right and the owners in the building need to agree on a window product. Ferguson stated the owners need to agree on a product or an approach to window replacement. He added that he didn't see evidence that the existing windows couldn't be repaired. Igo stated he was concerned with the south, east and west elevations. Manning informed the applicant there are ways to get the windows repaired/replaced. The motion passed 8-0.

C. **289 Fifth Street East, Lowertown Historic District**, by Topline Advertising, Inc., for a sign permit to install vinyl signage on nine windows and three doors. Two projecting signs were approved by staff. The window/door signage was installed without HPC review or a sign permit. **File #10-042**

Staff read the report recommending conditional approval. Meyer asked for clarification about the number, location and size of signs that were installed. Lenny Russo, owner and chef of Heartland, and Gerry Flannery, contractor, were present to discuss the application. Russo stated there had been a breakdown in communication and the purpose of the appliqués is to draw the eyes up from street level. He informed that the southeast corner stairs are being recast at a foundry in Wisconsin and he's added a new make-up air unit and separate utilities and exhaust for the restaurant. All of the work shows a considerable investment in the building. Russo stated he understands there is repetition and the goal is to have strong visibility for the market and business. He stated that "clutter" is subjective and he believes the signage installed is consistent and complimentary.

Meyer asked for clarification about the amount of signage allowed. Trout-Oertel asked about the opening on the Broadway elevation. Russo stated he believes the signs are tasteful and that he has no intention of adding awnings or more signage. Trimble asked if all of the signage had been made. Russo replied, yes, all but the blade sign have been installed.

Joe Spencer, Mayor's Office, thanked Russo for the terrific project in Lowertown. He stated he respects the staff recommendation and process and sees the signage as elegant and tastefully done and hopes the HPC will consider that.

Meyer motioned to approve the application striking findings #2 and #6, adding a finding stating, "The signage is appropriate given the nature of the street level" and striking staff recommendation #1. Igo seconded the motion. The motion passed 8-0.

VII. PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW

A. **280 Fifth Street East, Lowertown Historic District**, by Alatus, Brian Gorecki, for preliminary review of a new, five-story, mixed-use brick building with parking below grade. (Spong 266-6715)

Staff read the report with preliminary findings. Brian Gorecki was present to discuss the project. Discussion focused on the materials and details of the primary facades, the corner and the grade change on Wall Street, the location and design of future artwork. Regarding the artwork, it should be flush to the building and a member of the HPC should be part of the artist selection process. Gorecki stated the meetings are Mondays at 9am most weeks at Urban Works in Minneapolis. The Capital River Council and Public Art Saint Paul are involved in the process. The design phase is the next 60 days. The commission gave examples of the parking ramp on East Seventh Street and the Grain Exchange building in Minneapolis. Staff added the art should be context sensitive and related to the broad history of Lowertown. The only major concerns for the secondary elevations were the blank wall and dramatic change at the base. The applicants stated they wouldn't argue that and will deal with the parking area walls. Ferguson suggested the Hardi Panels be shown with a dark finish to relate to the brick. Manning stated colors change the impact. Meyer stated the building has a thoughtful, restrained design. Ferguson agreed with Meyer.

B. **255** Sixth Street East, Lowertown Historic District, Gleeson Architects, Dan Gleeson, for preliminary review for exterior alterations to the parking structure and enclosure of the first level for restaurant space. (Spong 266-6714)

Staff read the report with preliminary findings. Dan Gleeson, architect, was present to discuss the project. He showed a sketch of the corner entrance and discussed making a color statement with banners, awnings and the fire escape. He stated they want to use bronze glass, as the building is 100% curtain wall construction and there is an energy factor. He added that the metal awnings would extend four feet. The building would have street presence and a human scale and keep the horizontal rhythm of the block. He also noted that he considered the project repair except for the addition of the restaurant. The plan includes repainting the parking ramp slabs and 60,000 sq. ft. of office space in the upper two floors that is heavy timber construction. The canopies would only occupy part of the street, as they are limited as to what can be done at the corner since the building is cantilevered over the property line. Mr. Gleeson discussed ideas for the fire escape such as glass block that would be lit from behind. Commissioner Meyer stated concern for the corner of the building becoming a home for pigeons. Staff reminded that the building is at a prominent entry point to Lowertown and the proposed work is modern. Staff asked that with the use of glass and awnings, how should the guidelines be interpreted with this building. Staff also asked about venting for the proposed restaurant. Gleeson informed it would be through the roof/parking screen and small/thin venting window systems for intake. Commissioner Manning addressed the corner stairs and glass block stating that the proposed ideas would draw more attention to an "odd situation." Commissioner Igo stated he was okay with the concept, metal awnings and tinted glass. Commissioner Ferguson

stated he likes the drawing, as it would be hard to do anything that wouldn't improve the building and he liked the canopies. He added that the building isn't consistent with the character of the historic district. Staff asked the commissioners to relate their statements to the guidelines. Commissioner Manning stated the building is non-contributing. Staff added it has unique characteristics and doesn't want the building to set a bad precedent since it was constructed in 1974. Staff stated having a difficult time with the colors and the architectural fabric. Commissioner Manning stated the need for a boxy profile and with the reveal at the corner, the upper floors look unsupported. That erodes the boxy profile. The awning introduces a new element that seems inappropriate. Gleeson stated it is to bring back the street scale. Manning added there is a right way to do it and to tie to the neighboring building by lining it up. Manning commented that metal awnings and fabric banners would set a bad precedent. Staff asked about changing the color of the awnings. Gleeson stated he likes the red because it is an Asian restaurant that will occupy the space. Manning and Gleeson discussed color and laser cut steel. Staff asked if the applicant had talked with anyone about the art ordinance since this is the entrance to Saint Paul's art district. Manning suggested talking to Public Art Saint Paul. Commissioner Mazanec stated he likes the open stairway and the corner highlighted entrance to the building and Lowertown and added that he does not see a problem with the awnings as they relate to the other buildings. Commissioner Trimble stated the corner will become pigeon property and it should be enclosed. Gleeson suggested maybe screen or a gauze wire. Manning concluded there are risks of this not being handled right and the guidelines are difficult to apply.

VIII. COMMITTEE REPORTS

- A. Public Safety Building update, 106 Process update (Manning, Igo) There was no update.
- B. 3M Workgroups/Advisory Committee (Trimble, Mazanec) Commissioner Trimble informed the commission that there had been no meetings, but gave a description about the strength of the eight story building that was demolished at the site and shared photos.
- C. Education Committee (Ferguson, Thomas, Trout-Oertel) Commissioner Ferguson stated the Committee would give a report at the October business meeting.

IX. ADJOURN: 8:00

Submitted by: C. Boulware